

Exhibit 14D

Letter from Captain Mohsen El Missiry, dated 7/11/00,  
Study Report Regarding Captain Gamil El Batoty, EgyptAir Accident Flight  
990 prepared by Dr. M. Adel Fouad M.R.C. Psych. London Consultant  
Psychiatrist

6 pages

July 11, 2000  
Mr. Greg Philips  
National Transportation Safety Board  
490 L'Enfant Plaza, S.W.  
Washington, D. C. 20594-0003

**Subject:** Study Report Regarding "Captain Gamil El Batoty, EgyptAir Accident Flight 990" prepared by Dr. M. Adel Fouad M.R.C. Psych. London Consultant Psychiatrist.

Dear Mr. Philips

Please find attached herewith, the Psychiatric Study Report Regarding "Captain Gamil El Batoty, EgyptAir Accident Flight 990" prepared by Dr. M. Adel Fouad M.R.C. Psych. London Consultant Psychiatrist.

This report is requested to be included in the Docket at the same level as the "Human Performance Factual Report", and the study report prepared by Dr. Malcolm Brenner NTSB Senior Human Performance Investigator.

Sincerely,

  
Captain Mohsen El Missiry  
Chief of Egyptian Investigation  
Committee

**Psychiatric Report Re :  
Captain Gamil El Batoty  
Egypt Air Accident Flight 990**

Work records either in the Air force or Egypt Air are satisfactory. No complaints from his colleagues or bosses. No history of psychiatric referral or treatment. No history of intractable medical illness. His last general medical check up at the aviation medical council was satisfactory (on 28<sup>th</sup> of July 1999).

In the Air Force he worked as an instructor in Military Aviation Academy. He did not join actual combat in the war. After 1973 war he returned to Egyptair and continued employment.

I interviewed the family after the accident. Capt. Battoty was married and had 5 children and 3 grandchildren. His sons are university students and two of them are about to be graduated. One of them is already working. The family appears to be stable and greatly respecting the deceased father. Capt. Battoty was almost a father figure for many of his relatives. Some of them showed marked grief reaction after the accident. Interviewing the relatives points that capt. Battoty had an affectionate personality with no psychopathic trends. He used to support many relatives financially as he was well off. There is no family history of mental illness nor suicidal attempts.

Capt. Battoty had no previous psychiatric treatment. He did not talk about suicide to any family member and did not leave any hint or written paper concerning this. He was making preparations for the marriage of his son in two months time.

His small daughter had an illness (L.E) and he took her several times to Doctor David in California. During the last visit the doctor reassured Battoty that his daughter had improved to a large extent with the treatment. On Battoty's last journey he was carrying his daughter's medical records that he had shown to doctor David. The family lost the entire medical record file as result of the accident, consequently his wife sent for the doctor to obtain duplicate copies.

Capt. Battoty's son Karim told me on the telephone that Cap. Battoty was bringing home a few things for the family. Among them, two tires for their car in Cairo.

His wife Omayma told me that battoty did not ask to leave the company, as he was already retiring in February. She said that he had many financial projects in his mind. He was due to take a good amount of money on his retirement from Egypt Air, almost 400,000 Egyptian pounds.

The letter from Cap. Battoty's friend Dr. Moh. El Rafei M.D. showed clearly the moral and mood before the accident. Dr. El Rafei is a leading psychiatrist practicing in U.S.A (copy of his letter included).

I interviewed his friends in Egyptair, especially his close friend Capt. Badawy there was a consensus of opinion that Battoty was always cheerful and that he loved life. He always accepted any pressure with satisfaction. He did not smoke or drink. While in New York on the day before the accident, Battoty gave Capt. Badawy a few tablets of Viagra. When Capt. Badawy asked for more tablets, he refused and said " I keep the whole bottle for many friends in Cairo".

I reviewed the interview summaries done by NTSB witness group, which was led by Bart Elias and others on 1 Nov. 1999. According to the interview summaries Capt. Battoty appeared to be friendly and helpful to others. Just before the accident there were no unusual events and everything appeared normal.

I listened to the CVR on 30<sup>th</sup> November . I can divide the recording into several parts:

**a. Entrance of Capt. Battoty into cockpit :**

There was a discussion about who would take over the first officer duties for the first part of the flight. This ended by Capt. Battoty saying, " I am going to eat outside then come back." However, copilot Adel asked Capt. Battoty to take over and the latter accepted and then asked for dinner.

**b. A period of discussion between the pilots:**

The discussion was mainly about criticism of other pilots and policies inside the company. This went on for some time and Capt. Battoty participated in the conversation. However, he doesnot sound angry rather he was calming and soothing to the others. He told Capt. Habashi not to worry, that "everything will be alright."

**c. Just before the accident:**

It was evident that Capt. Battoty had just finished eating and enjoying his dinner. The hostess asked him "Do you want more food?" He replied using the Arabid expression "Keda Foll awy" (No thank you, it was marvelous.).

**d. First stage of trouble :**

There is not much talking in this segment, other than Capt. Battoty asking repeatedly in an apprehensive way for the support of god using the word "Tawakalt Ala Allah".

**e. Final stages of trouble:**

Here there are many anxious voices. The way the voices address Capt. Battoty shows that Battoty was responding and cooperating with them.

**Comment :**

The CVR recording gives us a unique chance to listen and examine the affective state of the crewmembers just before and during the accident. What is important is not only the content of Capt. Battoty's speech, but also the manner and the tone of speech.

A sudden change occurred from the confidence, calmness and enjoyment to that of hesitation, apprehension and preplexity. There is no internal illness that can cause such a sudden change, rather this is consistent with conforming with an overwhelming and fatal external situation.

**The meaning of the word "Tawakalt Ala Alla"**

**Arabic:** توكلت على الله

**Pronounced:** " Tawakalt Ala Alla"

**Dictionary meaning:** " I rely on God " or " I put my trust in God"

This short sentence is very commonly used in Egypt. To know the exact meaning and uses of this sentence a western person should understand 1<sup>st</sup> the underlying Eastern religious background.

A basic Islamic belief is that during life humans are continuously supported and controlled by God. A religious person believes there are limitations to all his abilities. Consequently in any act he needs the support of God so as to be successful. The more the person is a believer the more common that he uses this sentence, so much so that many people may use it during routine minor acts like starting his way to work every morning.

Another important point about the use of this sentence, it is used only when one embarks on a good action and not a bad one. Good & bad as seen by his own society. Examples of good acts where this sentence could be used e.g. Major one like trying to save a person from drowning e.g. minor ones like starting a journey by bus or train.

Examples of bad acts where this sentence could never be used. e.g. major acts like killing somebody or planning to rob a house ...etc. e.g. minor acts like intending to hit his son or to quarrel with somebody.

Persons committing suicide usually take some preparatory measures to prevent any body from discovering their act or saving them back to their miserable life. Capt. Battoty did not take any measure of this sort. e.g. closing cockpit door .

**Conclusion :**

There is no psychiatric evidence that Capt. Battoty was suffering from depressive disorders or bipolar illness which contribute to 70% of suicide related deaths.

Also there is no evidence of schizophrenia , alchol abuse or any psychotic condition.

Going through the data before and during the flight 990 crash does not lead to any suspicion of deliberate suicide act.

**Dr. M. Adel Fouad**

*Adel Fouad*

**M.R.C. Psych. London**

**Consultant Psychiatrist**

6